



“Exploring Students’ Learning Attitude in the Context of “Love, rather than Punish” Slogan”

Rizwan Saeed: *Ph. D Scholar, Department of Educational Research & Assessment, University of Okara*

Syed Abdul Waheed: *Department of Educational Studies, University of Okara*

Nadia Gilani: *Department of Educational Studies, University of Okara*

Received: 23rd May, 2025

Accepted: 27th June, 2025

Published: June 30, 2025

KEY WORDS

ABSTRACT

Student Behavior, Academic Performance, Teacher-Student relationship, Parental Involvement, School Discipline.

The research was conducted in the province of Punjab, Pakistan. The focus of the study was to analyse the impact of the slogan having the meaning ‘Maar Nahi Pyar’ or ‘Love, not punishment’, from an educational perspective. The study utilized a qualitative research approach using narrative phenomenology. The sample comprised parents and teachers from both public and private schools. Participants were selected intentionally, as parent participants were interviewed to collect diverse perspectives. Teachers with five plus years of experience before the implementation of the slogan were selected. Data collection for this study was done through semi-structured interviews with teachers, followed by additional focused group discussions. Parents were granted semi-structured interviews. The study adhered to a constructive paradigm, emphasizing the importance of understanding and addressing educational practices through constructive methodologies. Data analysis followed Colaizzi’s (1978) seven-step method, ensuring a systematic and logical approach. This involved transcribing interviews, identifying significant clues, grouping them into categories, and developing major themes. Three key themes emerged: 1) a shift in student behaviour, with students becoming less fearful but also showing disrespect toward teachers; 2) a decline in academic performance; and 3) changing dynamics among teachers, students, and parents, with teachers feeling demoralized and parents defending their children. The study offers valuable insights for teachers, administrators, and policymakers, highlighting the need to balance positive teaching environments with academic rigor. By capturing the perspectives of both teachers and parents, it contributes to a holistic understanding of the slogan’s impact and enriches the discourse on educational reform in Punjab, Pakistan.

Introduction

Even if "Maar Nahi Pyar" has become more famous, there are still concerns and problems with it. One of the primary problems with this method is the potential for abuse and misinterpretation. Critics worry that it may be taken as a call to abolish all penalties for misbehavior, which would lead to chaos and laxity in schools. A five-point Likert scale was employed in the 2020 study, "Perceptions of Teachers Regarding Corporal Punishment and Its Effects on Students' Achievement at Primary School Level," which involved the random selection of 111 teachers. There were two open-ended questions and seventeen closed-ended ones. According to the teachers, "Maar nahi Pyar" is appropriate for elementary school pupils since punishment has a detrimental impact on both the children' behavior and academic achievement (Khalid et al.,2020).

According to a different study, physical abuse in schools is common in developing countries like Pakistan and is carried out under the guise of upholding school discipline. A multi-stage sampling technique was employed in this investigation. From the Primary Section of Higher Secondary Schools in two tehsils of District Faisalabad, 255 instructors, 23 head teachers, and 500 students were chosen. Research tools included a dichotomous questionnaire for students and a Likert scale for head

teachers and teachers. Different Data analysis techniques were used. While students' replies examined the existence of a high level of physical abuse by instructors in the schools, teachers' and head teachers' perspectives suggested that physical abuse occurs minimally (Rafique, 2019).

Similar to this, a study on the effects of physical punishment was carried out in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. A random sample technique was used to ask 360 elementary and high school pupils questions through an interview schedule. The findings show that students' personalities, academic performance, and mental health are all impacted in multiple ways by corporal punishment (Naz et al, 2011).

A qualitative study on corporal punishment was carried out in Lahore, Pakistan. Four instructors from a private school in Lahore were specifically chosen for this investigation. A self-made semi-structured interview guide was employed in the study. The data analysis showed that instructors' lack of skill to use substitutes successfully was the reason they felt disempowered in the classroom, not the implementation of the no-corporal punishment. Although the instructors supported the prohibition, they believed that the Pakistani government and school administration ought to provide training sessions for parents as

well as administrators and teachers (Siddique, 2020).

It can be difficult to identify the best strategy for striking a delicate balance between compassion and discipline. It is critical to recognise that any educational environment requires a certain amount of accountability and repercussions. Finding a balance between creating a caring and encouraging atmosphere and upholding a disciplined and orderly school community is therefore the difficult part. Following the implementation of the statute of no punishment, a second study on the usage of corporal punishment was carried out. The individuals were chosen through the use of purposive sampling. Four primary school teachers from a private school in Lahore provided information using a self-made semi-structured interview guide that examined three key facets of efficient classroom management. According to a qualitative content study of these three factors, instructors who are highly committed to their careers and possess strong classroom management abilities are less likely to use corporal punishment in their classrooms (Siddiqui, 2021).

The effect of the "Maar Nahi Pyar" method on classroom management is another important factor to take into account. Maintaining a supportive learning environment where all kids can succeed is a daily challenge for educators. Effective implementation of this strategy might require more

resources and training to provide teachers the know-how to run their classrooms without resorting to harsh punishment. Furthermore, the dominant school culture determines how well the "Maar Nahi Pyar" strategy works. Schools need to provide an environment where students, employees, and administrators work together with empathy, respect, and cooperation. To change current school climates, this cultural transition might necessitate a large time and effort commitment.

To sum up, the phrase "Maar Nahi Pyar" signifies a dramatic change in the way that school discipline is viewed. Although it encourages the virtues of compassion and empathy, there are issues and worries about how it will be used in real life. This study intends to investigate the complex effects of this motto on educational institutions, looking at both its potential for good and its possible drawbacks. We may learn more about the changing nature of discipline in education and its effects on schools, teachers, and students by exploring the history and context of this slogan.

Purpose of the Study

The study aims to explore the perspectives of the teachers and parents in the context of the slogan "*Maar Nahi Pyar*" on the students' behavior, academic performance and interpersonal dynamics of the school community. Specifically, this study aims to understand the significant shifts in the behavior and discipline of the students, since students reportedly become less fearful and more disrespectful towards their teachers. It also studies the decline in the performance

of the students which may be due to the 100% promotion policy which may have unintentionally undermine the academic rigor and accountability. Furthermore, the study aims to study the changing dynamics among students, teachers and parents, as teachers feel demoralized. On the other hand, parents' priorities their children's perspectives over teachers' viewpoint. By addressing these interconnected themes, the study aims to contribute to the nuanced understanding of the implications of the slogan and need of a balanced disciplinary and accountability approach in the teaching learning environment.

Research Questions

1. What difference do teachers and parents observe in students' attitudes towards learning before and after the advent of the "*Maar Nahi Pyar*" slogan?
2. What difference parents and teachers observe in the performance of the students after the advent of the slogan "*Maar Nahi Pyar*"?
3. What differences teachers observe in the dynamics of teachers , students and parents relationship after the advent of the slogan "*Maar Nahi Pyar*"?

Research Methodology

The study employed a qualitative design, more precisely a narrative phenomenology inquiry approach, to investigate the lived experiences of parents and teachers with regard to students' views following the adoption of the phrase "maar nahi pyar." In order to comprehend the phenomenon and its associated meanings, the researcher concentrated on learning about their ideas, feelings, and perceptions. Since information was obtained through direct interaction, the study was qualitative in nature. Broad questions were utilised to investigate

participants' experiences rather than predefined tests or hypotheses. Instead of being theory-based, data analysis used an inductive method that was motivated by the facts.

Selection of Participants

The study's participants were carefully chosen, and criterion sampling was employed to pick in-service teachers who met the requirement of having been in service for at least five years before the "Maar Nahi Pyar" slogan was coined. Six individual teachers and four targeted group interviews were done for this purpose. In a similar vein, the criteria-based purposive sampling technique was also used to choose the parents. Parents who had lived through both the time before and after the "Maar Nahi Pyar" slogan was introduced were chosen based on certain criteria. Six parents were interviewed one-on-one about this. There were no targeted group interviews for parents. Proper permission and willingness from the participants were assured. Additionally, their data privacy was guaranteed in letter and spirit.

Data Collection

Semi-structured interviews and focus groups were used to gather data. The interviews were made to be as flexible as possible so that participants may go into great detail about their experiences over the 57–96 minute sessions. In order to keep talks focused and gather specific opinions from parents and teachers about children' evolving behaviour, the effect of the phrase "Maar Nahi Pyar," and the evolving dynamics of students, teachers, and parents, guiding questions were employed.

Data analysis

There are a number of data analysis plans that are specifically related to phenomenological research studies. These are the modified Van Kaam method by Van Kaam, Colaizzi, Giorgi, and Moustakas. The goal of each of these phenomenological analysis techniques is to investigate the essence of the phenomenon. According to Errasti-Ibarrondo et al. (2018), there are three main stages involved in the processing of phenomenological data, which is gathered through in-depth interviews, observations, and other methods. These include: a) summarizing the experiences of the participants; b) analyzing the data; and c) interpreting the results.

Results of the Study

1. What differences have teachers and parents observed in students' attitudes toward learning before and after the advent of the "maar nahi pyar" slogan?

A discernible change in the behavior patterns of students has been brought about by the prohibition of punishment in educational environments. These prohibitions were implemented in an effort to foster a more sympathetic and welcoming classroom where discipline is handled holistically. However, pupils' behavior and reactions to disciplinary proceedings have changed significantly since traditional punitive techniques were eliminated. Due to this fundamental shift, educators and researchers have been attentively examining how student behavior has changed, exploring both the advantages and disadvantages of the punishment ban. . Due to this fundamental shift, educators and

researchers have been attentively examining how student behaviour has changed, exploring both the advantages and disadvantages of the punishment ban. To properly address students' needs, offer them the right kind of help, and create a supportive and encouraging learning environment that is advantageous to all parties, it is imperative to have a solid grasp of these behavioral shifts.

Shifting Attitudes Toward Learning

Teacher participant of focused group 1, who was teaching at the primary level of a girl's high school and was in additional charge of the school discipline explained that most students respect those teachers who deal with them strictly. Similarly, a parent participant, participant 3 described the students are not fearful of those teachers who don't use punitive measures. He explained this as *"In our school days, there was a lot of fear of two teachers, one of them was a physical education teacher and the other was an Arabic teacher. They used to punish a lot. The students used to disappear from their classes. Nowadays there is not any fear of teachers."*

Another teacher, participant 1 of the focused group 3 described that; *"Nowadays, the students take their teachers so lightly and easily that they don't give any attention to the teachers. Before this policy, they never take them easily. Before this, whenever, the students got the time they started reading wherever they were sitting or standing. Nowadays, I never observe such behavior from the students"*.

Participant 3, a male teacher, described that the performance of the students has been decreasing due to their nonserious behavior.

Participant 2 of the focused group 2, a female teacher, who was teaching science at the elementary level also described that the performance of the students has declined. Although the students got promoted to the next class their understanding level didn't improve. She also perceived some 8th graders in her class can't even write their names but they are very problematic for the other students too.

The performance of the students has declined. Although, they got a promotion their level of understanding didn't improve. They got promotions based on the government's policy of 100% passing out of students till 9th class. In my class, some students up to 8th grade aren't even able to write their names. Those students are very nonserious in their studies. They will roam around aimlessly here and there all the time.

Another teacher participant, participant 3 of the focused group 3 pointed out the non-serious behavior of the students as:

Some 8th graders are so fearless that when we say to them that learn their lessons, they will openly ask the teacher why we study seriously as they know that they will be promoted to the next clasquite easily.

Participant 4 of the focused group 3 also had similar views, he described this;

Nowadays, the students don't follow the rules and regulations but earlier students were engaged in such a manner that they followed the instructions wholeheartedly. Only 10% would listen to the instructions of the teachers and

the remaining will don't try to understand their teachers.

Similarly, Teacher Participant 6 noted that nowadays the student's mindset is that if teachers respect us then we will respect the teachers, otherwise, they will not respect the teachers. On the contrary, Participant 4 of the focused group 1, said she never relied on punishment and reflected that she dealt with students' issues psychologically. She reflected that once there was a student in her class who was suffering from domestic issues and why she was not doing her school-related tasks and assignments. Upon her counseling, she became a brilliant student and now she even has positions.

2. What difference parents and teachers observe in the performance of the students after the advent of the slogan "Maar Nahi Pyar"?

Declining Academic Performance and Accountability

Participant 2 of the focused group 1 described that students' mentality has now developed that the teachers can't do anything against them.

There is a difference in the performance of the students and their performance has been declined. Although, I punish the students very rarely, despite that there is some difference in their performance. It may be that a student's mental approach may be that he/she brought up this mentality that the teacher can't do anything against her.

Similarly, a parent participant, participant 3 described the students are not fearful of those teachers who don't use punitive measures. He explained this as "In our

school days, there was a lot of fear of two teachers, one of them was a physical education teacher and the other was an Arabic teacher. They used to punish a lot. The students used to disappear from their classes. Nowadays there is not any fear of teachers." Another teacher, participant 2 described that *"Before this slogan, even without resorting to punishment, students used to adhere to instructions out of a sense of responsibility, perhaps fueled by the underlying fear that failing to do so might incur disciplinary consequences."*

Another teacher participant, participant 2 of the focused group 3, a female science teacher, observed that before this slogan, students were found doing their work in their spare time, however, she never sees the students studying in their spare time nowadays. Things are not ideal since the fear of the teachers has ended. She expressed this: *"Last week, I was distressed because I worked so hard on their studies but there is no response from their side. Only five students did their work and the remaining 30 students did nothing"*. Similarly, parent participant 3 described that students nowadays don't study at home if their parents don't ask the students to focus on their sides. He stated; *"Children are free, after school time they don't bother to study"*.

Similarly, Participant 1, an English teacher, described that he felt distressed due to students' carelessness regarding their studies. Now the students take their teachers very lightly. However, on the other hand, in recent years, things have changed a lot as there is a better response from the students. In this regard, the following are the remarks

of a teacher participant, participant 3 of the focused group 1, a female teacher who had charge of discipline management at school. She described the change as:

At the inception of this slogan, students displayed a carefree attitude. However, today, their response has improved significantly. In the past, they would frequently be absent themselves from school without any communication with their teachers, but now, there's a positive change in their approach.

Teacher participant, participant 4 of the focused group 3 pointed out that this is due to the government policy of 100% retention, and 100 % promotion with this slogan. He explained this as:

although these types of students got promotions up to 8th grade, when they appear in the 9th class exams, they get supplies in 3 to 5 or 6 papers. Then the teachers suffer a lot due to their failures in their exams. Last year, more than half students were not able to clear the 9th class board exam.

Participant 3 of the focused group 3 also described that the student's performance has declined after the policy. she described;

It has impacted the students' performance as there is no fear in the minds of the students because they know that nobody will punish them. The second factor is the policy of government that nobody will be failed and every student must be promoted to the next class. Now the students are very relaxed whether we study or not we will be passed.

In government institutes, there are more qualified and experienced teachers as compared to private institutes. Due to a lack of accountability, the overall results of the public schools are compromised. Participant 3 of the focused group 3, perceived that accountability is an essential element in almost every sphere of life. He added;

Without the use of punishment, any system struggles to maintain order. Allah himself has outlined the importance of rewards and consequences for personal conduct. Presently, student performance hovers at a mere 50%, with a lack of focus on studies and disruptions by some affecting the diligent ones. Thus, lifting the ban on punishment becomes imperative. The students' disregard for education and disrespect for teachers is eroding our society. We need checks and balances to remind them of the importance of their actions and the need to prioritize their studies.

Participant 1 of the focused group 3, who was also head of the school expressed his views that student's educational performance has decreased. This is also evident from their poor performance in competitive exams. He added;

There are very few students who study without the use of corporal punishment. The standard of education has been decreased. This is the reason that the students who usually got good marks in their studies were unable to clear the competitive exams like NTS or PPSC.

Participant 2 of the focused group 3, compared the current situation with the situation before this policy.

The performance of the students was affected badly. Before this policy, 60-65 students got good marks, nowadays there are only 15-20% of students who got good marks. Now, although students don't focus on their studies the blame of it goes to the teachers. The morale of the teachers is decreasing day by day. I have also seen a lot of changes in the behavior of the students. most importantly, the respect of the elders, not only the teachers, has decreased.

3. What differences teachers observe in the dynamics of teachers , students and parents relationship after the advent of the slogan "Maar Nahi Pyar"?

Changing Teacher-Student Dynamics

Teacher participant, participant 3, who served more than 35 years expressed his disappointment. He was of the view that nowadays, there are no old obedient type students who used to listen and follow us. Now people say to us that don't punish our children as now the government has also asked the teacher to not use the stick. He described this situation as " *If nowadays we punish the students with a stick there is a 50 % probability that their parents will come and complain against us. Students don't respect us and consider us nothing*". Another participant, participant 3 of the focused group 1, who was a Primary School Teacher stated that now the students of higher classes don't even consider me as their teacher, although most of these

students were my students in previous classes.

Participant 4, expressed that now students are neither obedient nor they are disciplined. He added; *"There are behavioral changes in the students. earlier students, before this policy, were more obedient and disciplined. Nowadays, the students misbehave with the teachers. Their manners are not good"*. Similarly, Teacher Participant, Participant 6, a female elementary teacher described the student's behavior as: *"Their behavior with their fellows is also not good"*. Another senior teacher, participant 1 of the focused group 3 reflected that:

They now don't take us seriously. They even don't bother to listen to us carefully. They laughed when we advised them. All the teaching staff remains tense due to this type of behavior. They always think about what has happened to the students.

Another teacher participant no 5, a senior male teacher, also reflected that now the parents also misbehaved with the teachers when the students complained against the teachers. He described an instance as;

I bear witness to a distressing incident involving a fellow teacher following the implementation of this policy. The incident involved an eighth-grade student, and while I cannot provide precise details of whether the teacher scolded or punished the student as I was occupied in my class, what I can affirm is that the student's mother arrived at the school and engaged in abusive behavior towards the teacher.

Another participant, participant 2 described a similar sort of instance when a student's father came to school and misbehaved with the teacher. He described the instance as: *"The father of that abused the teacher. Even, I, being the teacher of that man, requested him a lot, but all in vain"*.

Participant 3 of the focused group 1 stated that only one gaze of the teacher would be enough for the students to students understand what the teacher wants from his/her students. but this is not the case nowadays. She added: *"Now they know that whether the teacher has a stick in her hands or not she can't do anything against her. And if she misbehaves against the teacher the school administration will neither expel nor punish us"* Participant 1, of the focused group 1, who was the head teacher of the school as well, also stated that there was a negative impact on the performance of students as the students know that teachers do have not any right to punish them. She added; *"There is a negative impact on the performance of the students. because they don't have any fear in their minds. Now they know that the teachers can't punish them because they don't have the right to punish"*.

She also added that not only the educational performance of the students has been declined but also there is degradation in the attitude and manners of the students. Now parents of the students demand respect for the students, instead of respecting the teachers. She described this as;

The attitude and behavior of the students have also changed a lot. Only those students now respect us who cordially respect the teachers or

elders now. The other students who used to respect for the sake of fear of punishment now don't respect the teachers. They now counter-arguments to the teachers on their faces. There are many complaints to me by the teachers that the students are misbehaving a lot. They don't have respect. On the other hand, ironically, some parents even wonder why the teacher or even the head teacher doesn't respect their children.

In summary, the ban on punishment in educational settings has had a profound impact on students' behavior and performance. While the primary goal of these bans is to create a more compassionate and inclusive learning environment, the elimination of traditional punitive measures has resulted in a variety of changes in how students respond to disciplinary actions. This highlights the need for a comprehensive approach to discipline that considers the individual needs of students. Educators and researchers must continue closely monitoring and analyzing these behavior and performance changes, acknowledging both the positive and negative effects of the ban. By gaining a deeper understanding of these shifts, educational stakeholders can implement targeted interventions and support systems to address students' needs and foster a positive learning atmosphere. Ongoing evaluation, adaptation, and collaboration are key to cultivating an environment that promotes respectful behavior, emotional growth, and academic success for all students.

Discussion

The study aimed to explore the perceived changes that occurred in the attitude of students, their academic performance and student- teacher dynamic after the advent of the slogan "Maar Nahi Pyar". Three core themes emerged from the study. Through interviews of the teachers and parents, it was revealed that although the slogan was aimed to promote positive teaching learning environment and end corporal punishment, however, its implementation has triggered serious consequences including attitude detritions, performance decline and student teacher relationship.

This discussion highlights the lived experiences and narration of teachers and parents regarding this slogan in light of the existing literature. Many of the challenges described by participants reflect a mismatch between **policy ideals and ground realities**, where neither students nor teachers were adequately prepared to transition towards this slogan. The findings are organized into three interrelated themes.

The study shows a decrease in obedience among students, indicating a lack of compliance with rules and regulations as well as instructions given to them. Secondly, students may exhibit less respect for teachers, potentially undermining the teacher-student relationship and hindering the learning environment. This study is consistent with Friezen (2012) steel et al. (2016), Raihani et al., (2019). On the other hand, this study is in contradiction to Dreber et al. 2008. Thirdly, there is an increased occurrence of harassment of teachers, suggesting a negative impact on teacher well-being and job satisfaction. Fourthly,

misbehavior with both peers and teachers becomes more prevalent, leading to a disruptive and hostile classroom atmosphere. The study also finds out that there are some incidences of harassment after the ban n punishment against the teachers. This study is consistent with López, 2009 and Kõiv, 2015 and is in contradiction with the study of Jiang, 2019.

Conclusion

The second significant theme identified was changes in students' behavior and performance following the introduction of 'Maar Nahi Pyar.' Teachers and parents reported a transformation in students' attitudes towards their studies, along with a decline in performance, indicating that the slogan's influence extended beyond behavior and negatively impacted learning outcomes. These findings illuminate the multifaceted consequences of this educational shift, shedding light on the intricate interplay between disciplinary approaches and student development within the Pakistani educational context.

The key findings concerning the impact of the "Maar Nahi Pyar" slogan on student behavior reveal significant shifts in the educational landscape. Firstly, this approach contributes to a decrease in student obedience, indicating a noticeable lack of compliance with established rules, regulations, and instructions. This shift in behavior poses challenges in maintaining order and discipline within the learning environment.

Secondly, there is a discernible decline in student respect for teachers, potentially eroding the teacher-student relationship. This erosion not only undermines the

educational experience but also hinders the creation of a conducive and respectful learning atmosphere.

Moreover, the research identifies an increased occurrence of harassment directed towards teachers, signaling negative consequences for teacher well-being and job satisfaction. This hostile behavior towards educators reflects a significant concern in the teaching profession.

References

- Dreber, A., Rand, D. G., Fudenberg, D., & Nowak, M. A. (2008). Winners don't punish. *Nature*, 452(7185), 348-351.
- Errasti-Ibarrondo, B., Jordán, J. A., Díez-Del-Corral, M. P., & Arantzamendi, M. (2018). Conducting phenomenological research: Rationalizing the methods and rigour of the phenomenology of practice. *Journal of advanced nursing*, 74(7), 1723-1734.
- Khalid., Batool, U., & Hussain, B. (2020). Perceptions of teachers regarding corporal punishment and its effects on students' achievement at primary school level. *Journal of Elementary Education*, 30(1), 27-38.
- Naz, A., Khan, W., Daraz, U., Hussain, M., & Khan, Q. (2011). The impacts of corporal punishment on students' academic performance/career and personality development up-to secondary level education in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Pakistan. *International Journal of Business and Social Science*, 2(12).
- Rafique, N., Naoreen, B., & Ayub, M. (2019). Prevalence of Physical

- Abuse at Primary School Level in District Faisalabad.
- Siddiqui, M. F., Arif, M., & Muhammad, Y. (2020). Maintaining discipline in private primary schools in the wake of ban on corporal punishment: A qualitative case study of teachers' perspectives. *Kashmir Journal of Education*, 1(2), 52-76.
- Siddiqui, M. F., Muhammad, Y., & Naseer, H. (2021). Principals' self-efficacy beliefs about managing bullying cases in secondary schools. *sjesr*, 4(1), 338-349.
- Witterholt, M., Goedhart, M., Suhre, C., & van Streun, A. (2012). The interconnected model of professional growth as a means to assess the development of a mathematics teacher. *Teaching and Teacher education*, 28(5), 661-674.